

**MINUTES OF HISTORICAL ADVISORY BOARD
REGULAR MEETING OF THURSDAY, DECEMBER 4, 2008
COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY HALL
2263 SANTA CLARA AVENUE – 7:00 PM**

CONVENE: 7:03 p.m.

ROLL CALL:

PRESENT: Acting Chair Miller, Board Members Irons and Owens

ABSENT: Board Member Lynch

STAFF PRESENT: Jon Biggs, Planning Services Manager/Secretary
to the Historical Advisory Board; Tony Ebster,
Permit Technician I/Recording Secretary

MINUTES: Minutes from the meeting of November 20, 2008
Motion (Irons)/Second (Owens) to accept the minutes with changes
Ayes: 3; Noes: 0; Absent: Lynch

AGENDA CHANGES AND DISCUSSIONS:

None

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS:

None

WRITTEN COMMUNICATION:

None

REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS:

(7-A.) PLN08-0211 – 2413 Buena Vista Avenue. The Applicant requests approval to remove the structure located at 2413 Buena Vista Avenue from the Alameda Historical Building Study List.

Mr. Biggs presented the staff report. He reiterated that the item was continued so staff and the Board could get an opinion from the City Attorney regarding the need for a Certificate of Approval if the site is removed from the study list. He informed the Board the City Attorney had indicated a Certificate of Approval would be required to demolish or relocate the structure, even if the site was removed from the Historical Building Study List.

Board Member Irons asked about the progression of the item if the Board denied the request and if it could go before the City Council on appeal.

The public comment period was opened.

Mr. Rob Ratto with the Park Street Business Association (PSBA) supported the request to remove the structure from the Historical Building Study List. He said that the new development is being held up and is costing the property owner money. He would like to see the new development move forward.

Mr. Christopher Buckley with the Alameda Architectural Preservation Society (AAPS) referred to the AAPS letter that was submitted at the November 20, 2008 meeting, and reiterated their recommendation to include as a condition of approval that the house be offered for a period of time to someone who would move it to a new location on the Island of Alameda.

The public comment period was closed.

Acting Chair Miller asked staff to remind the Board of the conditions suggested by Board Member Lynch at the last meeting that would allow for relocation of the house.

Mr. Biggs read the conditions for the Board.

Board Member Owens acknowledged the comment made during oral communications regarding the economic importance of the new project, but noted that economic considerations are not within the Historical Advisory Board's purview. He encouraged the other Board members to focus on whether the structure has the historical merit to remain on the list.

Acting Chair Miller stated that removal of another site on this street from the study list would be a mistake. He also said that because the architect or designer of the building is unknown is not a sufficient reason to remove the site from the study list.

Board Member Owens said that the structure has the historical integrity to remain on the list and its position in the neighborhood is significant. He added that the structure meets the applicable criteria for retention on the list.

Board Member Irons said that their purview is historic integrity and they are not supposed to consider the economic aspects of a project. He said that delisting the structure would undercut the standard by which they judge other sites.

Ms. Barbara Price mentioned that the property is private and people should not trespass onto the site.

Motion (Owens)/Second (Miller) to deny the request to remove 2413 Buena Vista Avenue from the Alameda Historical Building Study List based on the following finding:

The Board finds that 2413 Buena Vista Avenue shall remain on the City of Alameda's Historical Building Study list because this building embodies a distinctive architectural resource as an example of the Queen Anne cottage style. The building retains the majority of its distinguishing characteristics including form, drop siding, fish scale shingles, ornamental wood trim and double hung wood windows. It is not a requirement of the study list or of the National Register that a building be either a rare example or an outstanding example of a particular style.

Furthermore, the building shall remain on the study list because it is a part of a group of structures of particular historic significance to the City. This group includes the row of buildings on the same side of this block of Buena Vista Avenue and the row of buildings directly across the street. Although this setting has been compromised by the removal of the adjacent building and its replacement with a parking lot the group of remaining buildings continues to exemplify the early Victorian residential development of the City.

Ayes: 3; Noes: 0; Absent: 1 (Lynch)
Motion Carries

BOARD COMMUNICATIONS:

None

STAFF COMMUNICATIONS:

None

ADJOURNMENT: 7:23 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted by:

Jon Biggs
Planning Services Manager/Secretary, Historical Advisory Board